



Pomona Valley
Transportation
Authority

A partnership of the cities of Claremont, La Verne, Pomona and San Dimas

2120 Foothill Boulevard ■ Suite 116 ■ La Verne California 91750

phone 909-596-7664 fax 909-596-7399

February 12, 2020

**AGENDA
ITEM #5**

MEMORANDUM

To: Pomona Valley Transportation Authority

From: George L. Sparks, PVRTA Administrator 

Subject: **Recommended Contract Award for Management and Operations of PVRTA Transportation Services to First Transit**

Recommended Actions:

1. *Approve award of contract for management, operations and maintenance services for PVRTA Transportation Services to First Transit, Inc.*
2. *Authorize the Chairman to sign the final agreement with First Transit Inc.*

Evaluation Committee Recommendation

The Proposal Evaluation Committee recommends award of the contract for management and operations of PVRTA transportation services to First Transit, Inc.

Background

Since 1996, PVRTA has successfully operated its current service design using two contractors, one contractor operating the dedicated fleet of vehicles and a cab provider supplying on demand and overflow service. The existing design has become less effective in the last several years. Given the extent of the changes to its operating environment, PVRTA decided to pursue an evaluation of its service design and the development of a ten-year plan for the agency. The goal of the study was to create a roadmap for PVRTA for the coming decade.

A primary recommendation of the Service Design Analysis was to modify PVTA's service design to improve the reliability and consistency of PVTA services. After reviewing service design options, it was determined that a service model utilizing a single prime contractor responsible for the overall management of the service with the ability to utilize supplemental providers best addressed our service goals.

A Request for Proposals was released on October 23, 2019 with a submission deadline of December 17, 2019. Proposals were requested for an initial four year term and two additional two year options for a total potential term of eight years. Five proposals were received. Below is a listing of the firms submitting proposals and their projected cost for the full eight year term.

After an initial review by PVTA staff, two of the proposals First Transit and Southland were determined to be within the competitive range. The MTM Transit and Transdev proposal were eliminated based on cost, exceeding the lowest cost proposal by over 25%. The A-Para Transit proposal eliminated because it did not address several significant proposal requirements, including sufficient detail in staffing plans, wage and benefit programs and the driver resourcing plan for supplemental services.

The First Transit and Southland were then interviewed by an evaluation panel consisting of four members:

Kristin Mikula - City of Claremont
Lily Perez-City of Pomona
Nicole Carranza-PVTA Staff
George Sparks -PVTA Staff

Roy Glauthier, a consultant on transit operations and procurement to PVTA, served as a non-voting member of the panel to manage and monitor the procurement process and provide cost and technical analysis. Interviews were conducted on January 9, 2020.

Evaluation Panel Results

The evaluation panel scored the final proposals using the scoring criteria set forth in PVTA's Request for Proposal.

	Pts.
Financial Viability	5
Experience and Technical Competence	20
Qualifications of Key Personnel	15
Personnel/Management Program	15
Vehicle Maintenance Program	10
Adequacy of Proposed Facilities	10
Cost Effectiveness	<u>25</u>
Employee Retention	10
Service Improv Bonus	<u>10</u>
	120 pts.

The results of panel's scoring are shown below:

Proposer	Rank				Total by Rank*
	EV#1	EV #2	EV #3	EV #4	<u>Total</u>
First Transit	1	1	1	1	4
Southland Transit	2	2	2	2	8

* Lower is better

Staff Recommendation

The cumulative ordinal rankings from the evaluation panel rank the proposals as follows:

- 1st. First Transit
- 2nd. Southland Transit

After reviewing the evaluation panel's rankings and comments, PVRTA staff is recommending the award of the contract to First Transit. Key features of the First Transit proposal are summarized below:

Experience and Technical Approach

First Transit is a national transit firm with years of experience with demand response services like PVRTA's. First Transit has been the PVRTA dedicated vehicle service provider since 2013 and is very familiar with our services. First has significant experience with the prime contractor with supplemental providers model we will be implementing.

Management Team

The local management team proposed by First Transit is currently in place at our location and has made significant progress in improving the on time performance and productivity. Both the General Manager and Operations Manager have considerable

experience in managing services like ours. Jorge Gonzalez, the proposed General Manager has worked previously in services utilizing a prime contractor with multiple subcontractors. Mr. Gonzalez came from a service environment that utilized the software platform, proposed by First Transit, Ecolane. Mr. Gonzalez' extensive experience with Ecolane will be valuable in the transition to the new service model. A major feature of the model is the new software platform.

Transportation Facility, Maintenance and Training

The facility utilized by First Transit is well suited to our service. It has enough parking to allow all PVTA and Claremont's cutaways vehicles to be housed indoors. The facility is equipped with two lifts and the office areas were recently expanded to service the locations needs. First has compiled an excellent safety record at PVTA, recently going a year without an accident. The maintenance team is outstanding. The maintenance manager for the PVTA operation has over 20 years of experience with our fleet and has had outstanding results in terms of miles between road calls and the California Highway Patrol's annual fleet inspections.

Scheduling and Reservations Software

First Transit has proposed the installation of the Ecolane scheduling and dispatch software. The Ecolane software is in use in 80 different locations, 17 in California. PVTA staff has made two site visits to transit agencies using the Ecolane software. The user response to the Ecolane product has been very positive, resulting in performance improvements in locations where it has replaced other scheduling software.

Cost

The First Transit proposal was also the lowest in terms of cost. The First Transit proposal was 3.4% lower in cost to the next lowest offer. The First Transit cost proposal was in line with staff cost estimates and the figures in the Five Year Cost and Revenue Projections presented to the Board at the November board meeting.

Recommendation

The First Transit proposal meets the requirements outlined in our Request for Proposals. Based on the results from the evaluation panel and features of the proposal outline above, staff recommends the award of the contract for PVTA Transportation Service for an initial term of four years to First Transit.

The draft agreement with First Transit is attached, staff recommends that the Board authorize the Chair to sign the final agreement.